



ODRL – Action vocabulary for a review by legal experts in April/May 2014

Document history				
Revision	Issue Date	Pages	Author (revised by)	Remark
1	2014-04-24	7	IPTC Rights Expressions WG/Michael Steidl	

1 Outline

1.1 What ODRL is

The Open Digital Rights Language (ODRL) initiative is an international effort aimed at developing and promoting an open standard for machine readable policy expressions.

ODRL is a W3C Community group, find more at www.w3.org/community/odrl/

ODRL provides flexible and interoperable mechanisms to support transparent and innovative use of digital content in publishing, distribution and consumption of digital media across all sectors and communities. The ODRL Policy model is broad enough to support traditional rights expressions for commercial transaction, open access expressions for publicly distributed content, and privacy expressions for social media.

1.2 ODRL and IPTC

IPTC is active in the ODRL Community and has decided to base its rights expression standard RightsML (www.rightsmil.org) on ODRL. RightsML adds only a few news industry-specific facets to ODRL.

To achieve a high quality of the Action vocabulary IPTC has taken the action of its review by legal experts.

1.3 A short outline: design of ODRL

The main building block of the ODRL data model is the Policy: it expresses which action may be executed regarding a specific asset, including involved parties.

The key properties of a policy are:

- The specific type of the policy.
Note: the types are defined by a vocabulary in section 2.1 of this web page <http://www.w3.org/community/odrl/work/2-0-common-vocabulary-constraint-draft-changes/>
- The asset this policy is about – this also may be a clearly defined group of assets
- What action regarding this asset may be executed, grouped by
 - o permitted actions
 - o prohibited actions
- Actions being a duty of the assignee, linked to a permitted or prohibited action
Note: these permitted, prohibited and duty actions are defined by a vocabulary in section 2.2 of the web page above, *this vocabulary is the main area of the requested review.*
- Constraints which may apply to an action, e.g. geographic and temporal limitations, technical limitations of the presentation, limitations in the ways/channels/devices of the presentation.
Note: the constraints are defined by a vocabulary in section 2.3 of the web page above.
- The parties which are involved into this policy, with a qualifier defining the role of each party.
Note: the roles of parties are defined by a vocabulary in section 2.4 of the web page above.
- Last but not least: a globally unique identifier for this policy

Major design rules for creating a policy are:

- A policy expresses one of these options (but must not combine them):
 - o A request for an agreement
 - o An offer for an agreement

- An agreement between the involved parties
- A partial agreement: a wider agreement may be documented elsewhere and the policy covers a specific part of this wider agreement.
- A policy may include zero to many permitted actions
- A policy may include zero to many prohibited actions
- A policy may include a mix of permitted and prohibited actions
- A permitted or a prohibited action may be exposed to zero to many specific constraints.
- A permitted or a prohibited action may have zero to many duties linked to it.
- A policy should include the involved parties – this depends on the type of the policy (see above), in general this is an assigner and an assignee.

1.4 The Action vocabulary

As the outline above shows the action is the most expressive building block as it defines what exactly is permitted or prohibited or which duty has to be executed in the context of a policy.

Therefore ODRL has created a controlled vocabulary for this purpose which defines for each action:

- a globally unique identifier for the action which must be used by an ODRL policy
- a definition of what is permitted or prohibited by this action or what duty has to be executed
- optional comments on the use of the action
- a location of this action in a tree-like hierarchy of all actions.

2 Goals for the review

The Action vocabulary as of 24 April 2014 has been created by the ODRL community which is a group of persons with a strong background in translating business requirements regarding rights expressions into a data model and a formal technical syntax representing this data model. But the members of this group are not persons with a legal background and expertise or deep experience in formulating licenses or rights related contracts.

Therefore the ODRL community hands over the latest Action vocabulary draft to legal experts for a review to:

1. Check the wording of the definitions of the actions: are they unambiguous and sufficiently precise.
2. Check the wording of comments: do they clarify and support or obfuscate the definition.
3. Check the semantic scopes of the actions: are they overlapping, do any white areas exist based on the usual practice of license agreements
4. Check the hierarchy of the actions: the basic rule of the hierarchy is that narrower terms inherit the definition of a broader term. Does this create any contradictions or any undesired openness of the definition.
5. An important but also challenging facet of the Action vocabulary is the spatial global scope of the ODRL standard. The review should point out actions (and their definitions) which are quite differently defined and/or interpreted in different world regions or countries and therefore need special care.

The person or team doing the review is asked to:

- Point at any errors
- Propose alternative wordings to improve the definitions or comments in terms of legal quality.
- Point out any white areas regarding goal 3
- Provide advice for a globally applicable wording of definitions regarding goal 5

3 Action vocabulary

This is a copy of the latest draft of the Action vocabulary on the web page <http://www.w3.org/community/odrl/work/2-0-common-vocabulary-constraint-draft-changes/> as of 24 April 2014. (The actions for permissions or prohibitions and the actions for duties have been split into two tables for an easy review while the table on the web page combines both types of actions.)

The tables below show all action in lexical order of their identifying names.

Below the table the hierarchical structures of the actions are shown.

Legend of the Identifier column:

- The top term in bold is the name (in English) of the action which also is a component of the globally unique identifier of each action.
- The name of the Broader Term (= BT) in the hierarchy of actions. No BT line indicates that this action is at the top level of the hierarchy.
- The Usage shows for which building blocks of an ODRL policy this action may be used
 - o PP = for a Permission or Prohibition
 - o Duty = for a Duty

3.1 Actions representing a permission or prohibition

Identifier	Definition of the Semantics	Comment
aggregate BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of using the Asset or parts of it as part of a composite collection	
annotate BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of adding notations/commentaries to the Asset	
anonymize BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of anonymising the Asset	For example, to remove identifying particulars for statistical or other purposes.
appendTo BT: writeTo Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of adding data to the end of the Asset	For example, the ability to add record to a database (the asset)
archive BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of persistently storing the Asset	Constraints may be used for temporal conditions.
concurrentUse BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of multiple concurrent use of the Asset	
derive BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of creating a new derivative Asset from the Asset	
digitize BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of digitizing the Asset from its analogue form	
display BT: present Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of rendering the visual media Asset to an audience	For example; displaying an image on a screen.
distribute BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of distributing the Asset to a public audience	
execute BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of running the computer program Asset.	For example; machine executable code or Java such as a game or application.
extract BT: reproduce	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of extracting	For reuse along with, or within, another asset, or to stand alone.

Usage: PP	parts of the Asset and an unchanged insert into another Asset.	
give BT: transfer Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of transferring the ownership of the Asset and all related rights to a third-party without exchange of value	Ownership is transferred to the recipient. The original asset must be deleted by the owner.
index BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of indexing the Asset into a collection of assets	For example: to include the asset in a search engine database.
install BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of loading the computer program Asset onto storage device ready for operation	
lease BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act that the Assignee makes available the Asset to a third-party for a fixed period of time with exchange of value	During this period, the asset is only available by the third-party. Temporal constraints may be used. Next Policy is recommended for the third-party.
lend BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act that the Assignee makes available the Asset to a third-party for a fixed period of time without exchange of value	During this period, the asset is only available by the third-party. Temporal constraints may be used. Next Policy is recommended for the third-party.
move BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of moving the Asset from one location to another one	After the asset has been moved, the original copy must be deleted.
play BT: present Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of rendering an audio Asset to an audience.	
present BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of rendering media to an audience.	
preview BT: display Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of providing a short preview of the Asset to an audience.	For example; the first 5 minutes of a movie.
print BT: present Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of rendering an Asset onto paper or hard copy form to an audience.	For example; creating a permanent, fixed (static), and directly perceivable representation of the asset.
read BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of obtaining data from the asset	For example, the ability to read a record from a database (the asset)
reproduce BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of making an exact reproduction of the Asset	
secondaryUse BT: use	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of using the	For example, for marketing or profiling purposes.

Usage: PP	Asset for a purpose other than the purpose it was intended for	
sell BT: transfer Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of transferring the ownership of the Asset and all related rights to a third-party in exchange of value.	A Next Policy is recommended for the third-party
sublicense BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of granting a sublicense for using the Asset to a third-party	This action enables the assignee to create policies for the use of the asset for third-parties. Use of Next Policy to express any downstream constraints is recommended.
textToSpeech BT: present Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of reading out loud a text Asset by a technical system	
transfer Usage: PP	The Assigner transfers/does not transfer the ownership of the Asset and all related rights in perpetuity to the Assignee(s).	
transform BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of transforming the digital Asset into another digital format	Typically used to convert the asset into a different format for consumption/transfer on a third-party system
translate BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of translating the natural language of an Asset into another natural language.	A new asset is created by that action.
use Usage: PP	The Assigner grants/does not grant the right for using the Asset to the Assignee(s).	More details may be defined in a related licensing contract or commercial laws. Refined types of license-bases actions can be expressed by the narrower actions.
writeTo BT: use Usage: PP	The Assigner permits/prohibits the Assignee(s) to execute the act of writing to the Asset	For example, the ability to write a record to a database (the asset)

Permission/Prohibition Actions Hierarchy Overview

Permissions/Prohibitions involving two parties (assigner and assignee)

- transfer
- use
 - aggregate
 - annotate
 - anonymize
 - archive
 - concurrentUse
 - digitize
 - distribute
 - derive
 - execute
 - index
 - install
 - move

- present
 - display
 - preview
 - play
 - print
- read
- reproduce
 - extract
- secondaryUse
- textToSpeech
- translate
- transform
- writeTo
 - appendTo

Permission/Prohibition actions towards third-parties only

- (use)
 - lease
 - lend
 - sublicense
- (transfer)
 - give
 - sell

3.2 Actions representing a duty

Identifier	Definition of the Semantics	Comment
acceptTracking Usage: Duty	The Assigner requires that the Assignee(s) executes the act of accepting that the use of the Asset may be tracked	The collected information may be tracked by the assigner, or may link to a Party with role function "trackingParty".
attribute Usage: Duty	The Assigner requires that the Assignee(s) executes the act of attributing the Asset to a Party	May link to an Asset with the attribution information. May link to a Party with role function "attributedParty".
delete Usage: Duty	The Assigner requires that the Assignee(s) executes the act of permanently removing all copies of the Asset	
ensureExclusivity Usage: Duty	The Assigner requires that the Assignee(s) executes the act of requiring the Assigner to ensure the Permission on the Asset is unique to the Assignee	A duty in which the Assigner is the same as the Assignee and is obliged to ensure the Permission granted is exclusive.
include Usage: Duty	The Assigner requires that the Assignee(s) executes the act of including other related assets to fulfill the full duty.	For example; Bio picture must be included in the attribution. Use of the Asset relation attribute is required.
inform Usage: Duty	The Assigner requires that the Assignee(s) executes the act of informing a Party that an action has	May link to a Party with role function "informedParty".

	been performed on the Asset	
nextPolicy Usage: Duty	The Assigner requires that the Assignee(s) executes the act of applying a specific Policy to a third-party for their use of the Asset	Used to indicate the policy terms for downstream use of the asset. If the asset is modified (e.g. translated) as an outcome of the original Policy, then the Next Policy applies to the derived asset.
obtainConsent Usage: Duty	The Assigner requires that the Assignee(s) executes the act of requiring explicit consent from a Party to perform the action on the Asset	Used as a Duty for the asset owners to decide on a case-by-case basis. May link to a Party with role function "consentingParty".
pay Usage: Duty	The Assigner requires that the Assignee(s) executes the act of paying a financial amount to a Party for use of the Asset	The payAmount constraint may be used to indicate the amount of the payment. The Payer is the Assignee and the Payee is the Assigner of the policy or, if specified, a new Party with role function "payeeParty".
reviewPolicy Usage: Duty	The Assigner requires that the Assignee(s) executes by a person the act of performing a review of the terms associated with the Asset.	Used when human intervention is required to review the policy. May link to an Asset which represents the full policy information.
uninstall BT: use Usage: Duty	The Assigner requires that the Assignee(s) executes the act of unloading the computer program Asset from a storage device and disabling its readiness for operation	The asset is no longer accessible.
watermark Usage: Duty	The Assigner requires that the Assignee(s) executes the act of applying a watermark to the Asset	A linked asset may indicate the watermark to apply.

Duty Actions Hierarchy Overview

- acceptTracking
- attribute
- delete
- ensureExclusivity
- include
- inform
- nextPolicy
- obtainConsent
- pay
- reviewPolicy
- uninstall
- watermark

=== END of document ===