

## **Comments to ITS V 1.0**

Submitted by Kara Warburton, Terminologist, IBM  
August 21, 2007

### **Section 1.1.1**

Change "mechanism which identifies" to "mechanism that identifies"

### **Section 1.2.1**

under "Content producers" bullet

Change "Aside:" to "Note:"

Change the last 2 sentences to the following:

The burden of inserting markup can be removed from content producers by relating the ITS information to content types in a global manner (see global rule-based approach). The global definition of the internationalization properties of information types, however, may fall to information architects, rather than to the content producers themselves.

Suggest you add a bullet describing the user type "Information architects" to this section.

### **Section 1.2.2**

Change "sketch" to "describe"

Remove "by looking at them"

Example 6

First sentence.

Change "The rules element..." to "The referenced rules document..."

Example 7

Change "is" to "are" in the first sentence.

### **Section 2.1.1**

Change "screen" to "exclude"

### **Section 2.1.2**

What does the "n" refer to in "n:term". There is no namespace declaration corresponding to the "n" prefix.

Also, this is not a good example of a non-translatable element, since in this case the content of <term> would normally be translated. It would be better to show examples that reflect practice, for instance, by using for the content something that is normally not translatable, such as a proper noun like "Java" or a

technical term like "HTML"

## Section 2.2

Change "By default elements are translatable." to "By default, the content of elements are translatable."

## Section 3.4

Example 12, by using an image file name for the object of the translate="yes" attribute, is a bad example, since image file names are never translated. I think you should choose something that is actually translatable in real life for this example.

## Section 4.2

Point 2-2.

Change "...on a rules elements" to "... on a rules element."

## Section 5.2.2

Example 15.

The text given for the its:dir="rtl" attribute comprises mixed directionality text (not just rtl text) by including the string "W3C". If you apply the rtl rule here, then this string will be rendered "C3W". This problem occurs in many examples of the rtl attribute both in this document (ITS V 1.0) and in the "Best practices for XML Internationalization" document. Wouldn't it make more sense for the sample to be written something like the following:

```
<title><quote xml:lang="ar" its:dir="rtl">..arabic text here..</quote>, W3C </title>
```

## Section 5.3

Example 17

Missing ">" for ending the <its:rules... opening element.

Change "... before processing the content of the rules element where the original XLink href attribute is." to "...before processing the content of the rules element containing the original XLink href attribute."

## Section 6.1

The text "if both local or global selection are absent" is confusing because of the use of "both" and "or". Or implies a choice, which contradicts "both". I am not sure if you mean "if either local or global selection are absent" or "if both local and global selection are absent".

Change "...elements are translatable, and attributes are not translatable.." to "...the content of elements are translatable, and the values of attributes are not translatable.."

Change "child notes" to "child nodes"

## **Section 6.2.2**

Change "The default is that elements are translatable and attributes are not." to "The default is that the content of elements are translatable and the values of attributes are not translatable."

## **Section 6.3.1**

Change "... it is impossible to translate the word "enabled" in isolation without knowing the gender, number and case of the thing it refers to." to "... it is impossible to translate adjectives and past participles such as "enabled" in isolation without knowing the gender, number and case of the noun that they refer to."

In the two bullets describing the two types of informative notes, change "the translator" to "translators". This makes the pronoun "they" correct.

I would remove the sentence about editing tools. It provides no value, is obvious, and is not relevant to this section.

## **Section 6.3.2**

Examples 26 and 27 are missing markup at the end of the <its:locNoteRule.../> element.

In example 28, I don't understand the meaning/origin of the attribute xml:space="preserve" attribute. Maybe this needs explaining? Also, there is a missing set of quotation marks to signify the end of the locNote attribute.

## **Section 6.4.1**

The reference to ISO 12200 should be changed to ISO 16642. ISO 12200 is outdated (its actually SGML not XML) and ISO TC37 SC3 will soon withdraw it. The best reference here would be to ISO 16642 "Terminological markup framework". This standard defines a core model for all terminology markup formats to adhere to.

If you agree to quote 16642 please update the References section (remove 12200 and add 16642). The specific reference is:

ISO 16642

(International Organization for Standardization). Computer applications in terminology: Terminological markup framework. [Geneva]: International Organization for Standardization, 2003.

## **Section 6.4.2**

Example 30

I don't understand the meaning/purpose of the "[1]" string that follows term in the selector attribute. Could this be explained?

The example itself, using a specific reference (i.e. to #TDPV) in the rules element, seems not very

useful in practice, as it seems that this would mean that all terms in the document would point to this one and only reference. I can't imagine a situation where that would be the case.

### **Section 6.5.1**

Contains some errors:

Change "rlo" before "(left-to-right override)" to "lro"

Change "(right-to-left text)" after "rlo" to "(right-to-left override)"

### **Section 6.5.2**

Examples 33 and 35

Contain the same problem of mixed directionality text as in section 5.2.2

### **Section C**

<locNote> includes a "term" data category. This is not described anywhere in the document nor are there any examples of it. Could an example be included?

end of document