

Comments to Best Practices for XML Internationalization

Submitted by Kara Warburton, Terminologist, IBM
August 21, 2007

Section 2

Example 2

Change "Fichier no trouvé" to "Fichier non trouvé"

Example 4.

See my feedback for section 5.2.2 of the ITS V1.1 document regarding this example of directionality that actually includes mixed directionality text. This problem occurs several times in this document.

Example 10 is intended to indicate the rules for the markup in example 9. However, example 10 says that this is a DITA document... but example 9 is NOT a DITA document. Change "for DITA" to "for the above document" in example 10.

Best Practice 6

Change "an nested" to "a nested"

Under example 12, change "as a nested an independent run of text" to "as a nested and independent run of text"

Best Practice 10

Example 18 may have errors or may need some changes. I don't understand how a <syn> element would be effective without some way of indicating what term this word is a synonym of. In the example, the word "alter ego" is a synonym of "doppelganger" yet there is no attribute for linking these two terms as synonyms. Also, the text says that "fetch" and "trusted friend" are additional synonyms but there is no markup to explicitly indicate this. I think that this example should be improved to demonstrate how to explicitly indicate through ITS the relationships between these terms. In its current state, the example fails to do this and appears weak.

The first bullet in Example 19 appears to have a mistake... it is the value of the *def* attribute on the term, not the value of the *ref* attribute on the term.

Change "To avoid such a large attribute data is repeated..." to "To avoid repeating so many attributes..."

Best Practice 11

I don't understand what the following means... Perhaps it just needs rephrasing:

"... which can be used to change the terminology-related information of attributes."

Same problem understanding "... may need to change the information indicating what is a term..."

Would it be accurate to say instead "... may need to change the way terms are identified...?"

Best Practice 13

The sentence "If possible avoid having element names reflecting the ID of the element" is confusing.

Would this be correct:

"If possible avoid using element names alone to identify elements."

Add more text to identify that Example 22 is an example of the wrong method and example 23 the correct method.

Best Practice 14

Change "Provides..." to "Provide..."

Add "to" after "pertains".

An additional bullet should be added to the set of bullets:

- The correspondence between any proprietary mechanism you have to indicate terms and its:term (*add corresponding reference to relevant section*).

Section 3

Add a bullet:

- Best Practice 24: Identify terms

A corresponding Best Practice 24 section need to be added. I suggest the following content.

NEW CONTENT...

Best Practice 24: Identify terms

Use markup to identify words that should remain consistent within the information set. These words include names of functions, features, programs, services, and so forth. They also include terms that are specific to the domain, such as technical terms, legal terms, and so forth, and they can include terms that simply occur often and so should be translated consistently.

How to do this

Provide examples here of the use of the its:term="yes" attribute locally, and of a global rule, and of an ITS rule to map proprietary markup to the ITS markup.

Why do this

If you do not indicate what words are terms of interest in the content, the translators will not know that these terms need to be translated consistently. Often, multiple translators are working on different files in a given project, and the way they choose to translate specific words can be inconsistent with the way that other translators have translated them. If important terms are marked in the content, the translation project manager can extract these terms from the content before the content is translated, and pre-translate them in the form of an electronic dictionary that all translators will use. This ensures consistency of translation of important terms.

end of new content

Best Practice 17

Change "... paragraphs or section of text..." to "... paragraphs or sections of text..."

Change "This type of decision is done..." to "This type of decision is made..."

Fix typo in Example 27 (inappropriate). Also change "to markup" to "to mark up"

Best Practice 21

The sentence "Error messages, quotations are an example of inserted text that usually would not cause problem." is not correct. Error messages in particular frequently contain automatically inserted text that is not independent and therefore problematic to translate. I would remove this sentence.

Change the sentence following that one to (bolding here is just to highlight the change):

"Avoid **using** inserted text that has any effect or dependence on the context where **it** is inserted."

Remove "put together" in the 2nd bullet.

Change the 3rd bullet to:

"or variables converted to text during document processing"

Change "... can be done different ways..." to "... can be done in different ways..."

Example 28. Change the first sentence to:

"In this example, the author, working with DITA 1.0, decided to reference a term in a termbase by using the conref mechanism."

Add a comma before "raise" in the sample sentence.

Change "...such construction..." to "...such a construction..."

Change "You do not want to separate the article from the noun." to "You should not separate the article from the noun."

Change "The article/noun separation causes also trouble..." to "The article/noun separation also causes trouble..."

Best Practice 23

Change "...where it is has least negative impact..." to "... where they have the least negative impact..."

Section 4.1

Change "...take in consideration..." to "... take into consideration..."

In the note, change "performances" to "performance". Change "For example, If most..." to "For example, if most..."

Section 4.1.1

Change "... the last rule wins." to "... the last rule is applied."

Section 4.1.2

Change "... for document using..." to "... for documents using..."

Section 5.1.1

Change "... as follow." to "... as follows."

Change "To use..." in the bullets to "Use..." Remove "either" in the 2nd bullet.

Section 5.1.2.1

Change "Again these definition makes use of .." to "Again these definitions make use of ..."

Section 5.3.2

I don't understand why the selector is "qterm"... what is the "q" for?

Section 5.4.1

Change "...as follow:" to "...as follows:"

Section 5.4.2

Example 48

The comment line for the 3rd last element contains a typo: "no in-line"... change this to "not in-line"

Section 5.5

Change "...to different platform..." to "... to different platforms..."

Section 5.6.2

Example 53

Why is "abbrev" listed as a translate="no" element? Abbreviations are often translated. This element does not seem to fit well in this list, which mostly includes non-translatable code (such as varname) and document information (such as author). I would remove "abbrev" from the list.

Why isn't "abbrev", "wordasword" and "acronym" included in the section on possible terms? These *are* candidate terms in Docbook.

end of document