

		A: David Singer	B: John M. Simpson	C: Jonathan, Peter, Tom	D: Justin & Erica	E: Shane et. al.
		Party Size				
1	A party is...	not addressed: explicitly called out as an open question	(1) what an ordinary user perceives as an entity (2) may include affiliates if commonly owned & branded (3) but no more than 5 affiliates	What an ordinary user perceives as an entity. Domain names, branding, and corporate affiliation are factors in user expectations	Preferred: based on reasonable expectation of a user (Jonathan's.) Can live with: discoverable (Shane's,) with stricter limits on exempted purposes	Common ownership & control (affiliates)
2	Ex. 0: are co-branded Flickr and Yahoo one party?		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
3	Ex. 1: google.com plus adwords, analytics, etc. one party?		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4	Ex. 2: geico.com & See's Candies one party?		No	No	Yes, but must be easily discoverable	No (Unless Geico and See's Candies are under common ownership)
5	Ex. 3: Mozilla and Opera jointly-own & control Moperilla, one party?		No	Yes: Mozilla, Opera, and Moperilla companies all get first-party privileges.	No: only Moperilla is a first party	Yes

		A: David Singer	B: John M. Simpson	C: Jonathan, Peter, Tom	D: Justin & Erica	E: Shane et. al.
		First Parties				
6	A first party is...	irrelevant - no 1st/3rd party distinction	can infer with high probability that users knowingly & intentionally communicated	can infer with high probability that users knowingly & intentionally communicated	users knowingly & intentionally communicated, <i>plus</i> the site the user intended to visit (e.g. not URL shortener or widget)	owner of the site visited; owner of widget etc. with which user meaningfully interacts
7	1st party must not		share w/ 3rd party, <i>except</i> : permitted uses <i>or</i> : user-granted exceptions	share info w/ 3rd party that 3rd party is prohibited from collecting itself	share w/ 3rd party if info can be correlated with the use's activity on 3rd party domains, <i>unless</i> 3rd party technical or legal assurance to honor same obligations as 1st party, <i>or</i> permitted uses, <i>or</i> user-granted exceptions	share (send or receive) collected data or profiles with another party (unless that party is ONLY working on the behalf of that specific party – aka Service Provider relationship)
8	1st party may		additionally enhance privacy	Best practice: voluntarily take (additional) steps to protect privacy	(explicitly no required musts for 1st party)	collect & profile in context of 1st party experience

		A: David Singer	B: John M. Simpson	C: Jonathan, Peter, Tom	D: Justin & Erica	E: Shane et. al.
		Third Parties				
9	A third party is...	irrelevant - no 1st/3rd party distinction	cannot infer with high probability that user knowingly & intentionally communicated	cannot infer with high probability that user knowingly & intentionally communicated	not a first party or a user	not a first party or a user
10	For DNT:1, 3rd party must not		<i>other than permitted uses or user-granted exceptions</i> , 1. collect/share/use info related to current communication 2. use info from previous communication where operator was 3rd party 3. retain info from prev com where operator was 3rd party 4. use info gathered while operator was 1st party	<i>other than exceptions</i> , collect, retain, use, or share info related to communication with a user or user agent	<i>other than permitted uses or user-granted exceptions</i> , 1. collect/share/use info related to current communication <i>except for permitted uses</i> 2. use info from previous communication where operator was 3rd party	<i>other than permitted uses or user-granted exceptions</i> , use data across multiple, non-affiliated websites. 2. aggregate, correlate, or use together data from multiple 1st party sites. 3. use prev. collected transactional data to profile or alter experience, 4. attempt to personally identify a user, 5. send/receive data or profiles w/ other parties (<i>except service providers</i>)
11	For DNT:1, 3rd party should not				<i>except for permitted uses</i> retain info from prev com where operator was 3rd party	
12	For DNT:1, 3rd party must				must treat data from another standard-compliant party w/ at least same level of protection required of other party	segregate data according to the 1st party from which it was collected

		A: David Singer	B: John M. Simpson	C: Jonathan, Peter, Tom	D: Justin & Erica	E: Shane et. al.
13	For DNT not 1, 3rd party may					1. receive data from another party and combine w/ 1st party profile data, 2. remove any prev. profiled data (<i>permitted uses and user granted exceptions prevail in all cases</i>)
Outsourcing partner / agent of a 1st party / 3rd party acting as 1st party						
14	Partner must	make data only available to 1st party	1. be under contract for specific service 2. retain only as long as needed for service	1. use all feasible tech to mitigate linkability of & prevent linking of data from different 1st parties 2. structural separation per party (“siloing”) necessary but not sufficient: a. separate data structures b. no shared unique ids 3. use sufficient internal practices to prevent linking data from different 1st parties 4. use data only on behalf of 1st party	1. have practices for collection, retention, use that at least comply w/ 1st party requirements 2. only make data available to 1st party 3. commit to comply as legally enforceable by 1st party, users, & regulators; data cannot survive past enforceability 4. reasonable tech precautions to prevent retention of data that could be correlated across 1st parties	segregated according to the 1st party from which it was collected
15	Partner must not	use data themselves	1. combine w/ other data 2. collect data that could be combined across 1st parties	use data for own business purposes, or any other reasons	use data for own business purposes, or any other reasons	aggregate, correlate, or use together data that was collected on different 1st party sites.
16	1st party must			1. represent outsourcing service providers comply 2. contract with provider requiring compliance		

		A: David Singer	B: John M. Simpson	C: Jonathan, Peter, Tom	D: Justin & Erica	E: Shane et. al.
Restricting Cross-Site Tracking						
17	Defn tracking	Retention by a party/site 1. after a user's transaction is complete, 2. of data that can associate that user with either (a) another party/site or (b) with data not collected during the transaction			Don't define tracking; explicit recommendation.	
18	Allowed	1. knowing about another site during a transaction 2. retaining records between your site and a user 3. retaining results of interaction 4. using real-time data for targeting <i>during</i> transaction 5. retaining data on users or on sites, iff unlinkable				
19	Not allowed	1. retaining site visited & ad shown for a user, 2. retaining full URL when it includes info from/ identifying site or about user, 3. retaining referrer info, 4. re-identifying user or facts about user and retaining that, 5. widgets recording browsing history (<i>w/out permission</i>)				

		A: David Singer	B: John M. Simpson	C: Jonathan, Peter, Tom	D: Justin & Erica	E: Shane et. al.
Part II: Permitted Uses						
Unlinkable Data						
20	Defined	Data that cannot be associated with a user is not in the scope of this specification.	Data de-id'ed by removing IP or persistent device ID	High probability only info that's 1024-unlinkable to users/user agents/ devices.	1. takes reasonable measures to de-id, inc. removing IP or persistent device ID, 2. publicly commits to not try to re-id, 3. contractually prohibits downstream re-id	Data "unlinkable" if it goes through de-id process, which is sufficient if reasonable steps to ensure data cannot reasonably be re-associated/connected to person/computer
21	Potential limitations		E, allowed <i>if</i> public commitment not to re-id, contractually prohibit downstream re-id	E, allowed for non-protocol info	E, allowed, no limits	(reference to DAA multi-site document)
Frequency Capping						
22	Defined	Historical tracking to minimize times user sees same ad	Historical tracking to minimize times user sees same ad		Historical tracking to minimize times user sees same ad	Historical tracking to minimize times user sees same ad
23	Potential limitations	E, allowed, <i>if</i> retain data only about ad-serving site	A, not allowed under DNT	E, may collect non-protocol information if it is, independent of protocol information, unlinkable data	1. ok if B, unlinkable, or D, aggregated, w/in 2 weeks <i>or</i> 2. ok if C, retention limit for as long as reasonably required for this purpose w/ notice to user	E, allowed <i>if</i> reasonable data minimization efforts to ensure only data necessary for use are retained
Financial Logging						
24	Defined	Ad impressions/clicks/ conversions tied to financial transactions for billing/auditing	Ad impressions/clicks/ conversions tied to financial transactions for billing/auditing			Ad impressions/clicks/ conversions tied to financial transactions for billing/auditing
25	Potential limitations	E, <i>if</i> do not retain user-identifying info <i>or</i> other-site info, <i>or</i> both	C, allowed w/ retention limits, as long as reasonably necessary for purpose. Data must not be used for other purposes.	E, may collect non-protocol information if it is, independent of protocol information, unlinkable data	1. ok if B, unlinkable, or D, aggregated, w/in 2 weeks <i>or</i> 2. ok if C, retention limit for as long as reasonably required for this purpose w/ notice to user	E, allowed <i>if</i> reasonable data minimization efforts to ensure only data necessary for use are retained

		A: David Singer	B: John M. Simpson	C: Jonathan, Peter, Tom	D: Justin & Erica	E: Shane et. al.
Third Party Auditing						
26	Defined	For 3rd party auditors to report on impression counting & quality of placement for ads	For 3rd party auditors to report on impression counting & quality of placement for ads			
27	Potential limitations	E, allowed <i>if</i> not both user-info and other-site info. If both, C, allowed with retention limit, until audit performed	C, allowed w/ retention limits, as long as reasonably necessary for purpose. Data must not be used for other purposes.	E, may collect non-protocol information if it is, independent of protocol information, unlinkable data	1. ok if B, unlinkable, or D, aggregated, w/in 2 weeks <i>or</i> 2. ok if C, retention limit for as long as reasonably required for this purpose w/ notice to user	E, allowed <i>if</i> reasonable data minimization efforts to ensure only data necessary for use are retained
Security						
28	Defined	Ad networks log data, share w/ 3rd parties to reduce attacks across ad ecosystem	Ad networks log data, share w/ 3rd parties to reduce attacks across ad ecosystem			
29	Potential limitations	C, allowed w/retention limits	C, allowed w/ retention limits, as long as reasonably necessary for purpose. <i>Only if</i> reasonable grounds to suspect fraud. Data must not be used for other purposes.	E, collect, retain, and use data, <i>if</i> reasonable grounds to believe user / user agent attempting to breach security at time of data collection	1. ok if B, unlinkable, or D, aggregated, w/in 2 weeks <i>or</i> 2. ok if C, retention limit for as long as reasonably required for this purpose w/ notice to user	E, allowed <i>if</i> reasonable data minimization efforts to ensure only data necessary for use are retained
Contextual Content / Ad Serving						
30	Defined	3rd party may collect/ use info from user agent string (inc. IP, referrer) for customized content	3rd party may collect/ use info from user agent string (inc. IP, referrer) for customized content			
31	Potential limitations	E, allowed. Using real-time data is fine, retention is not.	E, allowed, <i>but</i> data not retained beyond immediate transaction	E, may collect non-protocol information if it is, independent of protocol information, unlinkable data	1. ok if B, unlinkable, or D, aggregated, w/in 2 weeks <i>or</i> 2. ok if C, retention limit for as long as reasonably required for this purpose w/ notice to user	E, allowed <i>if</i> reasonable data minimization efforts to ensure only data necessary for use are retained

		A: David Singer	B: John M. Simpson	C: Jonathan, Peter, Tom	D: Justin & Erica	E: Shane et. al.
Research / Market Analytics						
32	Defined					
33	Potential limitations	E, allowed <i>if</i> data from user, not from other site/ elsewhere	D, allowed with aggregation <i>and</i> not linked to any user	E, may collect non-protocol information if it is, independent of protocol information, unlinkable data	1. ok if B, unlinkable, or D, aggregated, w/in 2 weeks	E, allowed <i>if</i> reasonable data minimization efforts to ensure only data necessary for use are retained
Product Improvement / Debugging						
34	Defined					
35	Potential limitations	E, allowed <i>if</i> data from user, not from other site/ elsewhere	D, allowed with aggregation <i>and</i> not linked to any user	E, may collect non-protocol information if it is, independent of protocol information, unlinkable data	1. ok if B, unlinkable, or D, aggregated, w/in 2 weeks <i>or</i> 2. ok if C, retention limit for as long as reasonably required for this purpose w/ notice to user	E, allowed <i>if</i> reasonable data minimization efforts to ensure only data necessary for use are retained
Fraud Prevention						
36	Defined					
37	Potential limitations			E, collect, retain, and use data, <i>if</i> reasonable grounds to believe user / user agent attempting to commit fraud at time of data collection		